

A SECOND SPECIAL ISSUE ON EMDR IN PTSD AND OTHER PSYCHOPATHOLOGICAL CONDITIONS

Antonio Onofri

I have the pleasure to present a second special issue of *Clinical Neuropsychiatry*, as the previous one completely dedicated to “EMDR beyond PTSD”.

The first issue contained papers about EMDR and Depression, Eating Disorders, Panic Attacks, OCD, Childhood and Adolescence, Refugees and Asylum Seekers and a review by Marco Pagani and Sara Carletto about the EMDR’s mechanisms of functioning.

In this second issue, the reader will find papers about different topics, written by some of the major scholars of the items: EMDR and Complicated Grief (by Roger Solomon), EMDR and Personality Disorders (by Dolores Mosquera), EMDR in Emergency (by Elan Shapiro), EMDR in Psychoncology (by Elisa Faretta) and two short papers on EMDR in Bipolar Disorders (by Ludovica Bedeschi) and Psychosis (by Michele Marconi and Andrea Polidoro).

The effectiveness of EMDR therapy in treating Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD) has been evaluated by several meta-analyses (Van Etten and Taylor 1998, Bradley et al. 2005, Davidson and Parker 2001, Seidler and Wagner 2006, Benish et al. 2009, Jonas et al. 2013, Chen et al. 2014, 2015); this led to its inclusion in many international clinical guidelines and eventually to the final recognition by the World Health Organization (2013) of EMDR as an elective treatment for PTSD in children, teenagers, and adults and by the more recent appreciation of the U.S. Veterans Affairs Department (2017).

Nevertheless, someone considers EMDR as a therapy still partially controversial: the American Psychological Association (APA) Practice Guidelines for the Treatment of Post-traumatic Stress Disorder (2017) concluded that there was strong evidence for cognitive behavioral therapy (CBT), cognitive processing therapy (CPT), cognitive therapy (CT), and exposure therapy, yet weak evidence for Eye Movement Desensitization and Reprocessing (EMDR). This is despite the findings from an associated systematic review which concluded that EMDR leads to loss of PTSD diagnosis and symptom reduction. Depression symptoms in PTSD were also found to improve more with EMDR than control conditions. In that review, EMDR was marked down on strength of evidence (SOE) for symptom reduction for PTSD. However, there were several problems with the conclusions of that review.

Dominguez and Lee (2017) point out how this review highlights some serious inaccuracies regarding the way studies were handled in the statistical review of papers, particularly with respect to evidence concerning EMDR. Therefore, they believe that the subsequent conclusions of the draft guidelines are flawed. Such failure to acknowledge errors explains why the proposed 2017 guidelines are at odds with other best practice guidelines from other countries and international based guidelines such as Cochrane Reviews (2013), the World Health

Organization in 2013 (World Health Organization 2013), the U.S. Veterans Affairs Department (2017).

In any case, as we tried to show in the first special issue of this Journal, the application of EMDR is nowadays no longer limited to the treatment of PTSD: its use is currently expanding to the treatment of other psychopathological conditions and comorbid disorders (de Bont et al. 2013, Novo et al. 2014, Perez-Dandieu and Tapia 2014).

It is important to remember that traumatic events surely contribute to the etiological conditions of many psychiatric disorders (Kim and Lee 2016, Millan et al. 2017) and that a comorbid diagnosis of PTSD can worsen the prognosis of other psychiatric disorders (Assion et al. 2009). Therefore, several studies have analyzed the effect of EMDR on other mental health conditions such as complicated and prolonged grief, emotional disturbances present in cancer diagnosis, emergent situation, psychosis, bipolar disorder, unipolar depression, anxiety disorders, substance use disorders, and chronic pain. In some of these conditions – for example in phobias (De Jongh and ten Broeke 2007) – there are many data available and it is quite probable that in the next future EMDR will be considered an evidence-based treatment. Then, as Valiente-Gomez et al. remember (2017), EMDR therapy has demonstrated preliminary positive evidence in one Randomized Control Trial (RCT) as a promising therapy to treat depressive symptoms in unipolar depression (Hase et al. 2015). Furthermore, it might be a helpful tool to facilitate psychological and somatic improvement in patients with myocardial infarction who suffer subsequent depressive symptoms (Behnamoghdam et al. 2015). EMDR therapy has demonstrated in 4 RCTs a positive effect on anxious and OCD symptoms (Feske and Goldsteina 1997, Nazari et al. 2011, Doering et al. 2013, Triscari et al. 2015) and it could also be a useful therapy in substance use disorders with a history of traumatic life events, in order to improve the prognosis of these patients (Perez-Dandieu and Tapia 2014). Besides, EMDR therapy could help as an adjuvant psychotherapy to standard treatment of alcohol dependence directly decreasing craving (Hase et al. 2008). EMDR seems to be a safe and effective therapeutic strategy also in reducing pain intensity and disability in patients with chronic back pain. For other conditions, for example psychotic disorders, despite the impact and the high prevalence of comorbid PTSD in them, evidence of the use of EMDR in psychosis is still scarce (Valiente-Gomez et al. 2017).

We now know more about the neurophysiological mechanisms implicated in EMDR (Pagani et al. 2017), and the next step will be exploring the following questions: are the Eye Movements and the other forms of Bilateral Stimulation useful only for reprocessing

traumatic events or can they be useful also for other psychopathological dimensions and cognitive disfunctions? Do we risk considering EMDR an oversolution for too many conditions? An answer to these questions could come only from many RCTs. At the moment, RCTs are a limited number and some of them take into account studies with very few therapeutic sessions and high heterogeneity in number and duration of EMDR therapy sessions (Hase et al. 2015, Kim et al. 2010, Behnammoghadam et al. 2015).

In general, EMDR therapy seems to be a safe intervention, without significant side effects (Feske and Goldsteina 1997, Hase et al. 2015, Doering et al. 2013, Novo et al. 2014, Perez-Dandieu and Tapia 2014; Triscari et al. 2015, van den Berg et al. 2015, Gerhardt 2016). This is of importance as it allows clinicians to consider EMDR therapy an appropriate treatment in various psychiatric comorbid conditions without causing side effects.

## References

- American Psychological Association (2017). *Clinical Practice Guideline for the Treatment of PTSD*. APA Press, Washington.
- Assion HJ, Brune N, Schmidt N, Aibel T, Edel MA, Basilowski M, Juckel G, Frommberger U (2009). Trauma exposure and post-traumatic stress disorder in bipolar disorder. *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology* 44, 1041-1049.
- Behnammoghadam M, Alamdari AK, Behnammoghadam A, Darban F (2015). Effect of Eye Movement Desensitization and Reprocessing (EMDR) on Depression in Patients With Myocardial Infarction (MI). *Glob J Health Sci*. 7, 6, 258-262.
- Benish SG, Imel ZE, Wampold BE (2009). Corrigendum to "The relative efficacy of bona fide psychotherapies for treating post-traumatic disorder: a meta-analysis of direct comparison". *Clinical Psychology Review* 28, 766-775.
- Bradley R, Greene J, Russ E, Dutra L, Westen D (2005). A multidimensional meta-analysis of psychotherapy for PTSD. *American Journal of Psychiatry* 162, 214-227.
- Chen YR, Hung KW, Tsai JC, Chu H, Chung MH, Chen SR, Liao YM, Ou KL, Chang YC, Chou KR (2014). Efficacy of eye-movement desensitization and reprocessing for patients with post-traumatic stress disorder: a meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. *PLoS ONE* 9,8, e103676.
- Chen YR, Zhang G, Hu M, Liang X (2015). Eye Movement Desensitization and Reprocessing vs. cognitive-behavioral therapy for adult post-traumatic stress disorder: systematic review and meta-analysis. *Journal of Nervous and Mental Disorders* 203, 443-451.
- Davidson PR, Parker KC (2001). Eye movement desensitization and reprocessing (EMDR): a meta-analysis. *J Consult Clin Psycho* 69, 2, 305-16.
- de Bont PA, van Minnen A, de Jongh A (2013). Treating PTSD in patients with psychosis: A within-group controlled feasibility study examining the efficacy and safety of evidence-based PE and EMDR protocols. *Behavior Therapy* 44, 717-730.
- De Jongh, A, ten Broeke E (2007). Treatment of Specific Phobias With EMDR: Conceptualization and Strategies for the Selection of Appropriate Memories. *Journal of EMDR Practice and Research* 1, 1, 46-56.
- Doering S, Ohlmeier MC, de Jongh A, Hofmann A, Bisping V. (2013). Efficacy of a trauma-focused treatment approach for dental phobia: a randomized clinical trial. *Eur J Oral Sci* 121, 6, 584-93.
- Dominguez SK, Lee CW (2017). Errors in the 2017 APA Clinical Practice Guideline for the Treatment of PTSD: What the Data Actually Says. *Front Psychol* 8, 1425.
- Feske U, Goldsteina J (1997). Eye movement desensitization and reprocessing treatment for panic disorder: a controlled outcome and partial dismantling study. *J Consult Clin Psychol* 65, 1026-1035.
- Gerhardt A, Leisner S, Hartmann M, Janke S, Seidler GH, Eich W, Tesarz J (2016). Eye Movement Desensitization and Reprocessing vs. Treatment-as-Usual for Non-Specific Chronic Back Pain Patients with Psychological Trauma: A Randomized Controlled Pilot Study. *Front Psychiatry* 7, 201.
- Hase M, Balmaceda UM, Hase A, Lehnung M, Tumani V, Huchzermeier C, Hofmann A (2015). Eye movement desensitization and reprocessing (EMDR) therapy in the treatment of depression: a matched pairs study in an inpatient setting. *Brain and Behavior* 5, 6.
- Jonas DE, Cusack K, Forneris CA, Wilkins TM, Sonis J, Middleton JC, Feltner C, Meredith D, Cavanaugh J, Brownley KA, Olmsted KR, Greenblatt A, Weil A, Gaynes BN (2013). Psychological and pharmacological treatments for adults with post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD). *Psychological and Pharmacological Treatments for Adults with Posttraumatic Stress Disorder (Internet)*. Available online at: <http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/23658937>.
- Kim J, Lee SH (2016). Influence of interactions between genes and childhood trauma on refractoriness in psychiatric disorders. *Progress in NeuroPsychopharmacology and Biological Psychiatry* 70, 162-169.
- Millan MJ, Ricca V, Oliver D, Kingdon J, Valmaggia I, McGuire P (2017). Deconstructing vulnerability for psychosis: Meta-analysis of environmental risk factors for psychosis in subjects at ultra-high risk. *European Psychiatry* 40, 65-75.
- Nazari H, Momeni N, Jariani M, & Tarrahi MJ (2011). Comparison of eye movement desensitization and reprocessing with citalopram in treatment of obsessive-compulsive disorder. *International Journal of Psychiatry in Clinical Practice* 15, 270-274.
- Novo P, Landin-Romero R, Radua J, Vicens V, Fernandez I, Garcia F, Pomarol-Clotet E, McKenna PJ, Shapiro F, Amann BL (2014). Eye movement desensitization and reprocessing therapy in subsyndromal bipolar patients with a history of traumatic events: a randomized, controlled pilot-study. *Psychiatry Res* 30, 219, 1, 122-8.
- Pagani M, Carletto S (2017). A Hypothetical Mechanism of Action of EMDR: The Role Of Slow Wave Sleep. *Clinical Neuropsychiatry* 14, 5, 301-305.
- Perez-Dandieu B, Tapia G (2014). Treating Trauma in Addiction with EMDR: A Pilot Study. *J Psychoactive Drugs* 46, 4, 303-9.
- Triscari MT, Faraci P, Catalisano D, D'Angelo V, Urso V (2015). Effectiveness of cognitive behavioral therapy integrated with systematic desensitization, cognitive behavioral therapy combined with eye movement desensitization and reprocessing therapy, and cognitive behavioral therapy combined with virtual reality expo. *Neuropsychiatr. Dis Treat* 11, 2591-2598.
- U.S. Veterans Affairs Department (2017). *Management of Posttraumatic Stress Disorder and Acute Stress Reaction*. VA/DoD Clinical Practice Guidelines, Mental Health Guidelines.
- Valiente-Gomez A, Moreno-Alcazar A, Treen D, Cedron C, Colom F, Perez V, Amman BL (2017). EMDR beyond PTSD: a Systematic Literature Review. *Frontiers in Psychology* 1-10.
- van den Berg DP, de Bont PA, van der Vleugel BM, de Roos C, de Jongh A, Van Minnen A, van der Gaag M (2015). Prolonged exposure vs eye movement desensitization and reprocessing vs waiting list for posttraumatic stress disorder in patients with a psychotic disorder: a randomized clinical trial. *JAMA Psychiatry* 72, 3.
- Van Etten ML and Taylor S (1998). Comparative efficacy of treatments for post-traumatic stress disorder: a meta-analysis. *Clinical Psychology and Psychotherapy* 5, 126-144.
- World Health Organization (2013). *Guidelines for the management of conditions that are specifically related to stress*. WHO, Geneva.